PELICAN BAY SERVICES DIVISION BOARD REGULAR SESSION
MARCH 6, 2019

The Pelican Bay Services Division Board met on Wednesday, March 6, 2019, at 1:00 p.m. at the Community Center at Pelican Bay, 8960 Hammock Oak Drive, Naples, Florida 34108.

In attendance were:

Pelican Bay Services Division Board
Scott Streckenbein, Chairman
Tom Cravens, Vice-Chairman
Joe Chicurel
Jacob Darnourni (absent)
Ken Dawson

Pelican Bay Services Division Staff
Neil Dorrill, Administrator
Marion Bolick, Operations Manager

Also Present
Tom Barber, Agnoli, Barber & Brundage
Sean Callahan, County Manager’s Office
Jim Carr, Agnoli, Barber & Brundage

Nick Fabregas
Pete Griffith
Bohdan Hirniak
Susan O’Brien
Mike Shepherd
Rick Swider (absent)
Mary McCaughtry, Operations Analyst
Lisa Jacob, Associate Project Manager (absent)
Barbara Shea, Recording Secretary
Mike Chaffee, Pelican Bay Foundation
John Gandolfo, Pelican Bay Foundation
Jim Hoppensteadt, Pelican Bay Foundation
Trent Waterhouse, Pelican Bay Foundation

APPROVED AGENDA (AS AMENDED)

1. Pledge of Allegiance
2. Roll Call
3. Agenda approval
4. Approval of 02/06/19 Regular Session meeting minutes
5. Audience Comments
6. Administrator’s report
   a. Update on sign contract
   b. US 41 berm clean-up and restoration bid opening
   c. February Clam Pass aerials
   d. Clam Pass monitoring RFP submittals
   c. February financial report
7. Committee reports
   a. Clam Bay
   b. Landscape & Safety
      i. *PB sidewalk replacement project discussion and approval to proceed
         with design plans including specifications, surveys, and permitting
      ii. Ridgewood Park re-forestation project (add-on)
   c. Water Management
   d. Budget
8. Chairman’s report
9. Old business
10. New business
11. Adjournment

ROLL CALL
Mr. Damouni and Mr. Swider were absent and a quorum was established

AGENDA APPROVAL
Mr. Cravens motioned, Mr. Dawson seconded to approve the agenda as amended with the addition of item #7bii. The motion carried unanimously. Mr. Streckenbein announced that the sidewalk issue (item #7bii) would be discussed directly after Audience Comments.

APPROVAL OF 02/06/19 REGULAR SESSION MEETING MINUTES
Mr. Cravens motioned, Mr. Hirniak seconded to approve the 02/06/19 regular session meeting minutes as amended. The motion carried unanimously.

AUDIENCE COMMENTS
Mr. Trent Waterhouse requested that the PBSD provide advance notice to the Chateaumere Property Manager of any mulching activities to be performed at the PBSD maintenance area at 6200 Watergate Way.

Mr. Mark English commented: (1) he urged the PBSD to use bonds rather than short-term borrowing to finance long-term PBSD projects and (2) he urged the PBSD to negotiate the 12 acres.

PROPOSED SIDEWALK PROJECT DISCUSSION
Dr. Chicurel provided a presentation on the proposed sidewalk replacement project including photos of the existing deteriorating, cracking, unsafe, aging sidewalks in Pelican Bay. Highlights included in the following.

- The project’s goal is for replacement sidewalks to be 6 feet wide concrete (the County standard), ADA compliant, may meander, and may be 5 feet wide in some areas to mitigate conflicts with trees, utilities, etc.
- A preliminary analysis by our engineers Agnoli, Barber, & Brundage (ABB) identifies potential impact to 7 hardwood trees, 7 sabal palms and 1 pine tree. A slideshow was presented to show that in reality one hardwood tree and one pine tree would have to be removed because the design parameters will allow the sidewalks to meander around trees remain at its present width or be five feet wide.
- The services of a certified arborist will be employed when tree root involvements are encountered.
- During the past few years, the PBSD has received many resident complaints about the deteriorating sidewalks as well as reports of bodily injuries caused by them.
- The next step would be for ABB to be tasked to prepare a design plan, surveys and specifications for a sidewalk system in PB that is environmentally sensitive, maintains our tree canopy, is resident safe, ADA compliant, and consistent with State and County standards.
• During the past two years, Mr. Streckenbein has provided articles on this proposed project in the PB Post; the Landscape & Safety Committee has placed notifications in the PBF e-blast.
• It is expected that the engineering and design work would take approximately 11 months to complete and actual sidewalk construction would not begin for at least one year.
• The PBSD has not obtained a firm written cost sharing commitment from the County.

Mr. Harry Weingartner commented on (1) the lack of consideration by the PBSD to repair the existing asphalt sidewalk, (2) the PBSD’s choice to take on the sidewalk replacement project before any of the other deferred projects, (3) the proposed sidewalk project’s removal of 18 trees and root cutting, (4) the possibility of using an alternative material such as Flexi-Pave.

Mr. Eric Steiner commented on the lack of PB Post articles on the proposed sidewalk project and expressed the need for more publicity on this issue.

Ms. Jean Waters commented that the sidewalks are the responsibility of the County, not the PBSD, and suggested that PB residents are not “up to speed” on this issue.

Ms. Mary Johnson commented that (1) the County has not adequately maintained our sidewalks, (2) alternative materials such as Flexi-Pave should be evaluated by the PBSD, (3) the root pruning of over 90 trees will weaken our canopy trees and may result in additional loss of trees in future storms.

Mr. Mark English questioned if it would be possible to sue the County. He suggested that the negotiated annual cost sharing payments from the County should be indexed to inflation.

Ms. Evelyn Blum commented that the PBSD should not take on the sidewalk responsibility, which currently belongs to the County.

Ms. Linda Roth suggested that the PBSD keep an open mind and explore alternative porous upscale materials for our sidewalks, even though they may be more expensive.

Mr. Owen Johnson commented that (1) the PBSD should put more pressure on the County, (2) the PBSD should explore alternative materials and not rule out asphalt, and (3) concrete sidewalks will give PB the look of a city.

Ms. Pat Bush commented that sidewalks with an increased width of six feet will encourage more bikes on the sidewalks.

Mr. Bob Sanchez suggested that (1) the PBSD explore Flexi-Pave and other alternative materials, (2) the cost of the project be spread over the life of the infrastructure, (3) bond financing is the only sensible option, and (4) the PBSD should move ahead.

Ms. Betty Weingartner expressed concerns over (1) more bikes on the sidewalks with a wider six-foot width, (2) the use of concrete may be harder on one’s knees, and (3) tree root shaving may weaken our trees.

Mr. Trent Waterhouse commented on (1) the dangers of falling on asphalt material, (2) the cost of Flexi-Pave material is approximately 40% higher than concrete and requires a UV protectant spray treatment every three years, and (3) the next step in this process would be to fund the sidewalk replacement project.

Mr. Ted Raia summarized the following points, (1) the County is responsible for our sidewalks and they should be held financially responsible, (2) if PB residents want better sidewalks, then they will have to pay for them, (3) the use of cost effective environmentally sensitive materials on replacement sidewalks would be preferred, and (4) a certified arborist should be brought in during the planning stage of the project.

Mr. Richard Alexander questioned why this $6 million project is not being coordinated with work on our other long-term projects.
Board discussion of highlights included the following.

- Ms. O'Brien suggested that at this time, we (1) explore alternative materials, (2) obtain a cost-sharing commitment from the County in writing, (3) engage an arborist, (4) begin an evaluation of easements that may be required as a result of expanded sidewalk widths, (5) amend the PBSD ordinance to add the sidewalk responsibility to the list of PBSD responsibilities, and (6) go forward with only the engineering/design plans for Phase 1 (not all three phases).

- Mr. Griffith commented in favor of the PBSD financing of the replacement sidewalk project, which would provide a higher standard of sidewalks for our residents. He suggested that for each tree that is removed, multiple trees be replanted.

- Mr. Streckenbein commented that all of the L&S Committee members fully support this project and that they discussed and concluded that it would be more efficient and cost effective to complete the engineering/design plan (approximate cost of $403,000) for the entire project up front. He commented that he is open to exploring alternative materials. Mr. Streckenbein commented that he intends to set up a meeting with County Commissioner Solis to discuss the sidewalk project and a possible cost share annual payment from the County.

- Mr. Shepherd commented that we need to go forward with the preparation of the design plan and suggested that the cost sharing negotiations with the County would be likely be more productive with a design plan on the table. He suggested going forward with the project regardless of a County contribution. Mr. Shepherd commented that he supports completing all the engineering up front which would include obtaining a master permit, in light of the fact that County requirements could change over a few years. He expressed support for the actual construction to be completed over three years.

Mr. Dorrill commented that the County's land development code requires concrete for sidewalks and does not allow for a variance mechanism. An alternative sidewalk material would require an amendment to the code. Dr. Chicurel commented that alternative materials will be discussed at the next Landscape & Safety Committee meeting on March 18.

**Mr. Griffith motioned, Mr. Hirniak seconded that we approve all the engineering work for this project. After discussion by the board, Mr. Griffith withdrew his motion, and Mr. Hirniak withdrew his second.**

**Dr. Chicurel motioned, Mr. Cravens seconded that the PBSD Board direct Agnoli, Barber & Brundage (ABB) to prepare design plans including surveys and permitting for the replacement of the sidewalks in Pelican Bay according to their submitted document entitled, "Engineering, Survey, Design, and Permitting Fees" that is located in today's agenda item 7.b. page 2 of 4. The motion carried 8-1, with Ms. O'Brien dissenting.**

**A SHORT RECESS WAS TAKEN AT 2:46 PM; THE BOARD RECONVENED AT 3:04 PM**

**ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT**

**UPDATE ON SIGN CONTRACT**

Mr. Dorrill commented that our replacement street sign project contract has been let. A mock-up of a prototype sign and associated foundation to our specifications will be provided to staff, within the next three weeks, for review and approval (of materials and workmanship) before the contractor begins work.
US 41 BERM CLEAN-UP AND RESTORATION BID OPENING
Mr. Dorrill reported that bids were opened on Feb. 26 for the US 41 berm restoration project and five bids were received. The lowest bid is for $315,000 by Heritage Utilities. The County Procurement Dept. is in the process of qualifying the lowest bidder. Mr. Dorrill will bring the lowest qualified bid back to the PBSD Board for approval at its April board meeting, before it is brought to the BCC for approval in mid-April. Mr. Bolick commented that our landscape architect, Ms. Ellin Goetz, has rejected Heritage Utilities as a qualified bidder. Mr. Dorrill commented that the next lowest bid is $477,000 by Stahlman England.

RIDGEWOOD PARK RE-FORESTATION PROJECT (ADD-ON)
Mr. Dorrill reported that he has received a second submittal of a design plan for tree and shrub replacement on the south side of Ridgewood Park from our landscape architect Ms. Ellin Goetz. He commented that staff will evaluate the plan and consider the installation as a change order to the 41 berm restoration project. Mr. Griffith commented that he and PBF board members had met with Ms. Goetz to provide input on preferred trees and shrubs to be included in her design plan. The PBF will pay for all of the landscape materials.

FEBRUARY CLAM PASS AERIALS
Mr. Dorrill commented on the January and February Clam Pass aerials provided in the agenda packet; overall conditions are very favorable.

CLAM BAY MONITORING RFP SUBMITTALS
Mr. Dorrill commented on the results of the request for quotes for the biological monitoring of Clam Bay, in furtherance of the Clam Bay Management Plan. Two responses were received, with Earth Tech Environmental being the lowest responsive bidder.

Ms. O’Brien motioned, Mr. Cravens seconded that we approve the contract for Earth Tech which is $212,250 for the 3-year contract and will be funded one year at a time. The motion carried unanimously.

BAY COLONY “BEACH DUNE SWALE” RESTORATION
Ms. O’Brien commented that in May 2018 we were found to be “not in compliance” in regards to the beach dune swale by the South Florida Water Management District (SFWMD), and noted that we have spent three months on a survey and five months on permitting. She suggested that this project be expedited.

Mr. Dorrill responded that the PBSD has provided a response to the SFWMD that appears to be acceptable to them. During the last two fiscal years, we have removed significant hurricane debris and exotics from the swale. We have asked for an interpretation as to whether we need a permit modification. Mr. Dorrill commented that he and Mr. Cravens have met with the affected condominium association and are planning to provide another update to those residents at their annual meeting. Mr. Dorrill expects the regrading and recontouring of the swale to begin in the Fall.

FEBRUARY FINANCIAL REPORT
Mr. Dorrill commented that the PBSD recommended FY19 budget appropriation for “purchased irrigation water” for approximately $132,000 was inadvertently omitted from the County’s budget software system. Mr. Dorrill stated that he has a meeting scheduled with the County Budget
Office on Friday, March 8 and will discuss processing a budget amendment to correct this. Mr. Dorrill also commented on “other contractual services” showing over budget in FY19. This relates to the Gulf Park Dr. median-cut project; the project is in the process of being capitalized.

Ms. O’Brien commented that the purchase of our new beach rake was charged to our beach renourishment fund. She suggested that these funds have been reserved exclusively for the purpose of future beach renourishment, and that the beach rake should be charged to a more appropriate budgetary line item. Mr. Dorrill and Mr. Streckenbein agreed.

Mr. Shepherd motioned, Mr. Cravens seconded to accept the February financial report. The motion carried unanimously.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

CLAM BAY REPORT
Ms. O’Brien provided her March 2019 Clam Bay update in the agenda packet. She highlighted (1) tidal ratios look very good (2) the 2018 Water Quality Report has been received and will be discussed at the 3/7/19 Clam Bay Committee meeting.

LANDSCAPE & SAFETY REPORT
Dr. Chicurel reported that the Landscape & Safety Committee met on Feb. 21, and the following items were discussed.

1. The sidewalk replacement project occupied most of the meeting’s agenda. The chairman gave a presentation outlining the county, state, and ADA standards for sidewalks, and the history of the sidewalk issue in Pelican Bay. Two slide presentations helped visualize the condition and the disrepair of the present asphalt sidewalks and how altering the County standards of 6-foot wide sidewalks with 5 foot segments and a meandering design would eliminate utility and hardwood tree conflicts. This flexibility resulted in only one hardwood tree needing to be removed instead of 7 hardwoods that the preliminary engineering study and cost opinion had indicated. The committee passed unanimously a motion to recommend to the full PBS Board that the board fund a detailed engineering design plan, with specs and surveys. Mr. Dorrill reported that staff was preparing an Executive Summary to memorialize a cost sharing agreement with Collier County to replace and then maintain the County owned sidewalks ($250,000 and $50,000 respectively).

2. Cpl. Wrobieski and Lancia of the CCSO were in attendance and informed the committee that the CCSO is cracking down on speeding in Pelican Bay with increased patrols and presence.

3. Mr. Cravens asked that the plants causing a dangerous “line of sight” issue at the Pebble Creek crosswalk when going north on PB Blvd. be removed. Mr. Dorrill indicated that would be done immediately.

WATER MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
Mr. Cravens commented on issues discussed at the 2/19/19 Water Management Committee meeting. Highlights on these issues included the following.

- Work has been completed in the drainage easement between the Dorchester and Grosvenor, including pipe cleaning. Ms. Denise McLaughlin commented on a “large open swale” in this area. Mr. Dorrill commented that he will ask our engineers to explore the possibility of “closing the toy” of this swale.
- Drainage improvements have been completed in Georgetown.
Mr. Bolick commented that the PBF’s ARB Committee has put a hold on any additional FBSD installations of boat ramps into PB lakes. Staff will meet again with the ARB Committee to discuss boat ramp alternatives.

Mr. Shepherd provided a report on ammonia levels in the 20 lakes in which blue tilapia were installed last Spring, and noted that there was no increase in the level of ammonia in any of these lakes. **Mr. Shepherd motioned, Mr. Cravens seconded that we begin stocking all of our lakes with blue tilapia except for the four control lakes that we will continue to monitor the ammonia levels in. After discussion by the board, Mr. Shepherd withdrew his motion, and Mr. Cravens withdrew his second.**

Ms. O’Brien commented that the board had discussed this issue six months ago, and had agreed that at least one of our scientists should weigh in on this issue. She suggested that the board vote on this issue, in the future, after a review of an opinion by one of our scientists.

Ms. Mary Johnson commented that the PBSD has always relied on our consultants. She suggested that the PBSD explore the other methods of controlling algae and table the motion.

Mr. Cravens commented that alternatives to copper sulfate have been explored by the PBSD and that the only other effective method of algae control in use by the PBSD is spraying the lakes with chemicals, which have documented toxic side-effects. He welcomed evidence of negative consequences from blue tilapia be brought to the board, and shown that these consequences outweigh the benefits.

Mr. Dorrill commented that he is aware of widespread community dissatisfaction with the level of algae control in our lakes, and that some residents have suggested returning to the use of copper sulfate. He will contact our Earth Tech consultants and request that they report back with scientific documentation/literature on the use of blue tilapia for algae control. He also commented that our zone is within the Florida Fish & Wildlife Commission where blue tilapia are recognized algae combatants as long as they are purchased from a licensed aquaculture vendor.

**BUDGET REPORT**

No report

**CHAIRMAN’S REPORT**

Mr. Streckenbein reported that a PBSD/PBF joint workshop will be held on April 4 and asked board members to provide topics for discussion to the PBSD Office.

Mr. Streckenbein commented that this would be Mr. Hirniak’s final board meeting as his term expires at the end of the month and thanked him for his service.

**OLD BUSINESS**

Ms. O’Brien commented that based on conversations with Mr. Dorrill and Mr. Callahan (County Manager’s Office) it may be possible for PB residents, other than PBSD board members, to serve on PBSD committees. Ms. O’Brien will explore this further.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:11 p.m.
Scott Streckenbein, Chairman

Minutes approved [ ] as presented OR [ √ ] as amended ON [ 4-3-19 ] date