PELICAN BAY SERVICES DIVISION
CLAM BAY COMMITTEE MEETING
JULY 11, 2019

The Clam Bay Committee of the Pelican Bay Services Division met on Thursday, July 11 at 1:30 p.m. at the SunTrust Bank Building, 801 Laurel Oak Drive, Suite 302, Naples, Florida 34108. In attendance were:

**Clam Bay Committee**
Susan O’Brien, Chairman

Denise McLaughlin
Rick Swider

**Pelican Bay Services Division Staff**
Neil Dorrill, Administrator *(by phone)*
Lisa Jacob, Interim Operations Manager

Mary McCaughtry, Ops. Analyst *(absent)*
Alex Mumm, Interim Sr. Field Supervisor
Barbara Shea, Recording Secretary

**Also Present**
Jennifer Bobka, Earth Tech
Mohamed Dabees, Humiston & Moore

Jacob Damouni, PBSD Board
Scott Streckenbein, PBSD Board

**APPROVED AGENDA (AS PRESENTED)**

1. Roll call
2. Agenda approval
3. Approval of 05/09/19 meeting minutes
4. Audience comments
5. Clam Bay
   a. Hand-dug channel maintenance
   b. Canoe trail markers 10 and 12
   c. Scaevola treatment
   d. Canoe Trail guide
   e. Pelican Bay Post articles
6. Clam Pass
   a. June tidal ratio report
   b. June aerial photos
   c. Bathymetric survey results
   d. Data on Clam Pass dredging
7. Water Quality
   a. First quarter report
   b. Copper results
   c. Impact of pond contamination on Clam Bay
8. Next meeting: September 10 or 12, 2019
9. Adjournment

**ROLL CALL**
All members were present and a quorum was established
AGENDA APPROVAL

Ms. McLaughlin motioned, Mr. Swider seconded to approve the agenda as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

APPROVAL OF 05/09/19 MEETING MINUTES

Ms. McLaughlin motioned, Ms. O'Brien seconded to approve the 05/09/19 meeting minutes as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

MR. DORRILL JOINED THE MEETING BY TELEPHONE AT 2:10 PM

AUDIENCE COMMENTS

None

CLAM BAY

HAND-DUG CHANNEL MAINTENANCE

Ms. Jennifer Bobka, Environmental Consultant with Earth Tech, provided a diagram of Clam Bay which identified key areas of this year's recommended hand-dug channel maintenance of approximately 2 ½ miles based on mangrove plot data. The key areas selected were areas with mangrove health scores either declining or not improving. Ms. Jacob commented that she is in the process of preparing request for quotes from County exotic removal contractors for this project.

Ms. McLaughlin provided an article, for submittal to the Pelican Bay Post, that she has drafted entitled, “Channels through the Mangroves” which was added to the record. Ms. O'Brien provided an edit to the article, stating that most recently Earth Tech, not Turrell Hall & Assoc., has worked on hand-dug channel maintenance for us (second paragraph, fifth line). She also suggested that Turrell Hall consultants, Earth Tech consultants, and committee members review the article and provide any edits. The committee agreed that a photo should accompany the article.

CANOE TRAIL MARKERS 10 AND 12

Ms. Jacob reported on a recent conversation with Mr. Chris D’Arco, Sr. Field Inspector of the Collier County Coastal Zone Management Division, who reported that the County plans to re-install canoe trail markers 10 and 12 in August.

SCAEVOLA TREATMENT

Ms. O'Brien commented that we are continuing to work on developing a proposal for a future scaevola removal project, to be included in a future PBSO budget.

CANOE TRAIL GUIDE

Ms. Bobka provided a draft copy of the new canoe trail guide (prepared by Earth Tech) to the committee for review. Ms. O’Brien requested edits be provided to staff no later than July 19. Ms. Jacob is ready to send the draft to be printed. Ms. O'Brien suggested that once the new canoe trail guides become available, that “new canoe trail guides are available” be included in a future PB Post edition. Dr. Eabees suggested that the canoe trail map be added to the Pelican Bay app.

PELICAN BAY POST ARTICLES
Ms. McLaughlin commented that she is working on an article on our Clam Bay natural resource protection area plan and provided a copy of her rough draft, which was added to the record.

CLAM PASS

**JUNE TIDAL RATIO REPORT**
Not discussed

**JUNE AERIAL PHOTOS**
Not discussed

**BATHYMETRIC SURVEY RESULTS**
Not discussed

**DATA ON CLAM PASS DREDGING**
Dr. Dabees provided a presentation for purposes of addressing two issues, (1) summary and review of the Clam Bay Management Plan five years after including an analysis to determine whether the plan and/or the template can be improved, and (2) County concerns over the PBSD dredging of Clam Pass three years in a row (2016, 2017, and 2018). Ms. O’Brien commented that not only did we dredge three years in a row, but we also requested an emergency declaration each time, which is very concerning to the County. She recapped (1) at the beginning of FY2019, the County Manager’s Office expressed concerns to Mr. Dorrill regarding emergency Clam Pass dredging events three years in a row, and (2) in November 2018, a motion was passed by the PBSD Board whereby the board requested that the Clam Bay Committee explore the concerns raised by Mr. Casalanguida, Deputy County Manager, and bring a recommendation back to the PBSD Board. The committee decided to collect key data on dredging over the last 20 years, including key variables such as number of times, volume of sand removed, costs, equipment used, etc. The goal for the committee now is to discuss and decide which of this data should be presented to the PBSD Board, and then subsequently brought forward to a discussion with the County Manager’s Office.

Dr. Dabees stated that the goal of the Clam Bay Management Plan (approved by the BCC in January 2015) is to establish the basis and protocols for the management activities for the health of the Clam Bay NRPA estuary. The objective is to protect the environment and the ecosystem, and support the recreational use of the system. Ms. O’Brien suggested that Dr. Dabees focus his presentation on the reason for the 2016, 2017, 2018 dredging and what can we do differently to prevent this in the future.

Dr. Dabees provided a table of dredging history from 1999 to present, including volume of sand removed, dredge width, dredge depth, identification of sections dredged, and equipment used. Ms. O’Brien suggested that costs for each dredging event be added to this table.

Dr. Dabees provided a history over the same time period of severe storms. Dr. Dabees provided a table (2007-2018) showing both storm and dredging events, and concluded that this table clearly shows that the Pass was dredged in 2016, 2017, and 2018 as a result of multiple severe storms in a row, which gave the Pass no chance to recover. The Pass is fragile and recovery is slow after a storm event. Dr. Dabees noted that the current condition of the Pass is very good, one year subsequent to the last dredging event.
Ms. O'Brien summarized the items which the committee has agreed to share with the County Manager’s Office to include a 20-year timeline of dredging events, storm events, related cost information and a one-page discussion of key features and key variables of the Clam Bay system (as suggested by Ms. McLaughlin). She suggested that Dr. Dabeees bring any recommendations for additional data to share with the County, to the next committee meeting. Ms. O’Brien requested that Dr. Dabeees provide a copy of his 79-page powerpoint presentation/report to staff to forward to committee members to review before the next committee meeting, at which time the committee will decide what information to forward to the PBSD Board.

Dr. Dabeees commented that his final product would include an executive summary, with his report as the backup documentation. Ms. O’Brien commented that she was not aware that Dr. Dabeees was preparing a large technical report; it was her impression that Dr. Dabeees was just gathering key historicel data.

Mr. Dorril commented that as a point of clarification, the PBSD is obligated to do a 5-year technical update of the Clam Bay management plan. Per discussion with Humiston & Moore, the agencies are accustomed to 5-year management plan update. He noted that what gets presented to the County will be in “executive summary format” and it must also be appropriate to present to the permitting agencies. Ms. O’Brien commented that she was unaware of 5-year update requirements. Mr. Dorril commented that our deadline for a response to the County is Sept. 30 and that he will distribute a copy of Dr. Dabeees’ draft report to the committee, when it becomes available. Dr. Dabeees expects his draft to be available to the committee by Friday, Aug. 2.

WATER QUALITY
FIRST QUARTER REPORT
Ms. O’Brien commented that the first quarter water quality report, prepared by Dr. Tomasko, was received and included in the agenda packet. She noted that total phosphorus results continue to be problematic, with 26 of 27 results exceeding allowable upper limits. She also noted that phosphorous data at the six bern sites does not show a high level of phosphorous at the bern, and therefore the bern area cannot be the source of the Clam Bay exceedances. The committee will further discuss this issue with Mr. Hall, consultant with Turrell Hall, at a future meeting.

COUNTY LAB TEST RESULTS
Ms. O’Brien commented that the County Lab has not yet provided April and May test results. Ms. Jacob responded that she will follow up with the County Lab.

NEXT MEETING:
By consensus, the committee agreed that the next meeting of the committee would be held on Sept. 10, 2019 at 1:30 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT
The meeting was adjourned at 3:28 p.m.

Susan O’Brien, Chairman

Minutes approved [✓] as presented OR [____] as amended ON [____ 9-10-19] date